

THEMATIC MOTIFS:

- The Sacred and the Mundane
- Patience, Empathy, and Cruelty
- Faith, Religion, and Morality
- Wealth Inequality and Fear
- Storytelling
- Imagination and Allegory
- Happiness and Suffering
- Equality vs. Individualism
- Media and Ideology
- Dissent vs. Authority
- The Power of the Arts
- Separation and the Illusion of Security
- Racism and Property
- Individual vs. Society
- Coming of Age and Coming into Society

PART ONE: NOTES & THESIS PROPOSAL

Comparative Analysis Task

Reflect on the **thematic motifs** listed to the left, and **consider** how some of these ideas are explored in four short stories that we've read so far this year:

- "Harrison Bergeron" (Vonnegut),
- "Once Upon a Time" (Gordimer),
- "A Very Old Man with Enormous Wings" (Márquez), and
- "The Ones Who Walk Away from Omelas" (Le Guin).

Choose two of these stories that both seem to grapple with a common thematic motif. (Perhaps you feel that the two stories you choose present almost identical messages, or maybe you interpret substantially different meanings emerging from a similar motif.)

The choices an author makes are very important and worthy of your close attention. While **re-reading** these stories, **consider** and take some **notes** on how each author uses **literary devices** (e.g. plot structure, symbolism, point of view, irony) to explore a common thematic motif (which may or may not be from the list to the left) and how their choices convey meaning in their respective stories.

Include quotations as evidence, and cite with either line or paragraph numbers.

After thoughtfully re-reading the two stories and taking notes, finish off your notes by producing a single-sentence **comparative thesis statement** that makes a claim about how the two authors use literary devices to convey thematic meaning.

Please use one of the thesis frames below:

same thematic motif,
different devices,
different themes

While both "TITLE1" and "TITLE2" explore the concept of MOTIF, AUTHOR1 makes use of DEVICE(s)1 to convey that THEME1, yet AUTHOR2 suggests that THEME2 through the use of DEVICE(s)2.

Though "TITLE1" and "TITLE 2" both grapple with MOTIF, AUTHOR1's use of DEVICE(s)1 implies that THEME1 while AUTHOR2's choices involving DEVICE(s)2 suggest that THEME2.

same motif,
same devices,
different themes

In AUTHOR1's "TITLE1" and AUTHOR2's "TITLE2", both authors make use of DEVICE(s)1/2 and a common motif of MOTIF; however, AUTHOR1's choices suggest that THEME1 while AUTHOR2's decisions imply that THEME2.

same motif,
different devices,
same theme

Both "TITLE1" and "TITLE2" present the idea that THEME1/2; however, while AUTHOR1 makes use of DEVICE1 to explore MOTIF, the theme is conveyed in AUTHOR2's story primarily through his/her/their use of DEVICE2.

PART ONE scoring rubric

NOTES

THESIS

are mostly illegible or contain less than two pieces of relevant textual evidence ①	are partially illegible or contain less than a total of eight cited pieces of textual evidence ②	are legible and contain four or more cited quotations as relevant evidence from each story (at least two for each device if tracking more than one device per story) ③
is missing four or more elements or is not a single sentence ①	is missing one to three elements, is not defensible, or is not highlighted ②	contains all necessary elements (the ALL-CAPS words from the thesis frames) and is defensible with support from the texts and is highlighted ③

Comparative Analysis Task

PART TWO: OUTLINE DRAFT

with SAMPLES (of WOVEN, CITED QUOTATIONS)

Once your thesis statement from Part One has been **approved**, proceed working on an **outline** that presents a plan for least two body paragraphs. Your paragraphs should follow a logical structure and contain adequate textual evidence to defend the claims of your thesis.

Refer to the **notes you took in class regarding appropriate plans for body paragraph topics**. The most important thing is that each paragraph actually defends your thesis.

Be sure to include a total of at least six pieces of **cited textual evidence** (with at least two cited pieces of evidence per body paragraph).

Lastly, refer to the **notes you took in class on weaving and citing quotations**. Create two **sentences** (from different body paragraph) that feature **properly woven, cited quotations** (from different texts).

PART TWO scoring rubric

Outline offers no clear support for the claims of the thesis <u>or</u> support is entirely uncited. ①	One or more body paragraphs are either inadequately supported <u>or</u> do not clearly defend the thesis (e.g. mere summary). ②	All body paragraphs follow an appropriate, logical structure (complete with topic sentences) <u>and</u> have adequate, relevant, cited, textual support. ③	OUTLINE
Neither of the two samples present properly woven, cited quotations from the texts. ①	One of the sample sentences features a properly woven, cited quotation, but the other does not, <u>or</u> one or more of the samples does/ do not fit with the intent of their respective paragraphs. ②	Both sample sentences feature smoothly woven/integrated quotations which are parenthetically cited, <u>and</u> both samples fit with the intent of their respective body paragraphs. ③	SAMPLES